



Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

Meeting Minutes - Final

Policy Advisory Council

Pamela Campos, Chair
Michael Baldini, Vice Chair

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

10:00 AM

Board Room - 1st Floor

Roster

Carline Au, Michael Baldini (Vice Chair), Diana Benitez, Pamela Campos (Chair), Zack Deutsch-Gross, Anne Olivia Eldred, Ilaf Esuf, Christine (Chris) Fitzgerald, Gerry Glaser, William Goodwin, Pradeep Gupta, Dwayne Hankerson, Wendi Kallins, Randi Kinman, Charley Lavery, Adina Levin, Carina Lieu, Gabriela Orantes, Johnny Parker, Phillip Pierce, Vinay Pimple, Jeffrey Rhoads (Jeff), Terry Scott, Jaime Vilorio, Howard Wong, and Roland Wong

1. Call Meeting to Order / Roll Call / Confirm Quorum

- Present:** 22 - Chair Pamela Campos, Vice Chair Michael Baldini, Council Member Carline Au, Council Member Diana Benitez, Council Member Zack Deutsch-Gross, Council Member Anne Olivia Eldred, Council Member Gerry Glaser, Council Member William Goodwin, Council Member Pradeep Gupta, Council Member Dwayne Hankerson, Council Member Wendi Kallins, Council Member Randi Kinman, Council Member Charley Lavery, Council Member Adina Levin, Council Member Gabriela Orantes, Council Member Johnny Parker, Council Member Phillip Pierce, Council Member Vinay Pimple, Council Member Jeffrey Rhoads, Council Member Terry Scott, Council Member Jaime Vilorio and Council Member Howard Wong
- Excused:** 2 - Council Member Ilaf Esuf and Council Member Roland Wong
- Absent:** 2 - Council Member Chris Fitzgerald and Council Member Carina Lieu

Council Members Zack Deutsch-Gross, Anne Olivia Eldred, and Randi Kinman invoked AB 2449.

2. Compensation Announcement – Clerk of the Council

3. Welcome and Chair's Report - Welcome and Chair's Report - Pamela Campos, MTC Council Chair

- 3a. [24-1219](#) Chair's Report
(5 minutes)

Action: Information

Presenter: Pamela Campos, MTC Council Chair

4. Approval

- 4a. [24-1218](#) Approval of the October 22, 2024 Meeting Minutes (5 minutes)

Action: Approval

Presenter: Pamela Campos, MTC Council Chair

Attachments: [4ai 24-1218 2024-10-22 Policy Advisory Council Draft Minutes.pdf](#)
[4aii 24-1218 2024-10-22 Policy Advisory Council 4b.pdf](#)

Upon the motion by Council Member Scott and second by Council Member Gupta, the October 22, 2024 Meeting Minutes were unanimously approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye:** 20 - Chair Pamela Campos, Vice Chair Michael Baldini, Council Member Carline Au, Council Member Zack Deutsch-Gross, Council Member Anne Olivia Eldred, Council Member Gerry Glaser, Council Member William Goodwin, Council Member Pradeep Gupta, Council Member Dwayne Hankerson, Council Member Wendi Kallins, Council Member Randi Kinman, Council Member Charley Lavery, Council Member Adina Levin, Council Member Johnny Parker, Council Member Phillip Pierce, Council Member Vinay Pimple, Council Member Jeffrey Rhoads, Council Member Terry Scott, Council Member Jaime Vilorio and Council Member Howard Wong
- Absent:** 6 - Council Member Diana Benitez, Council Member Ilaf Esuf, Council Member Chris Fitzgerald, Council Member Carina Lieu, Council Member Gabriela Orantes and Council Member Roland Wong

Council Members Diana Benitez and Gabriela Orantes arrived after the approval of the October 22, 2024 Meeting Minutes.

5. Public Comments / Other Business

6. Information

- 6a. [24-1522](#) Plan Bay Area 2050+: Summer 2024 Engagement Findings (20 minutes)

Findings from the second round of Plan Bay Area 2050+ public and stakeholder engagement activities completed in summer 2024.

Action: Information and Discussion

Presenter: Leslie Lara-Enríquez and Veronica Cummings

Attachments: [6ai 24-1522_Cover_Summary_Sheet_PBA_2050+_Summer_2024_Engagement_Findings.pdf](#)
[6aii 24-1522_8ai_24-1147_Summary_Sheet_PBA2050+_Summer_2024_Engagement_Findings.pdf](#)
[6aiii 24-1522_8aii_24-1147_Attachment_A_Presentation_PBA2050+_Summer_2024_Engagement_Findings.pdf](#)
[6aiv 24-1522_8aiii_24-1147_Attachment_B_PBA2050+_Summer_2024_Engagement_Activities.pdf](#)
[6av 24-1522_8aiv_24-1147_Attachment_C_PBA2050+_Map_Summer_2024_Engagement_Activities.pdf](#)
[6avi 24-1522_8av_24-1147_Attachment_D_PBA2050+_Summer_2024_Public_Engagement_Findings.pdf](#)
[6avii 24-1522_8avi_24-1147_Attachment_E_PBA2050+_Summer_2024_Partner_Engagement_Findings.pdf](#)
[6aviii 24-1522_8avii_24-1147_Attachment_F_PBA2050+_Correspondence_Received.pdf](#)

6b. [24-1449](#) Transportation Revenue Measure Select Committee Update
(45 minutes)

Preview of anticipated discussion items of the Transportation Revenue Measure Select Committee meeting and update on previous discussions.

Action: Action

Presenter: Georgia Gann Dohrmann

Attachments: [6bi 24-1449 Cover Summary Sheet Transportation Revenue Measure Select Committee Update.pdf](#)
[6bii 24-1449 3ai 24-1155 Summary Sheet Transportation Revenue Measure Select Committee.pdf](#)
[6biii 24-1449 3aii 24-1155 Attachment A TRM Select Committee and Exec Group Roster.pdf](#)
[6biv 24-1449 3aiii 24-1155 Attachment B 4 Scenarios Explainer.pdf](#)
[6bv 24-1449 3aiv 24-1155 Attachment C Motions.pdf](#)
[6bvi 24-1449 3av 24-1155 Attachment D Gradients of Agreement.pdf](#)
[6bvii 24-1449 3avi 24-1155 Attachment E Scenarios Funding Details.pdf](#)
[6bviii 24-1449 3avii 24-1155 Attachment F Compilation of Feedback.pdf](#)
[6bviii 24-1449 3aviii 24-1155 Presentation Select Committee Update.pdf](#)
[6bx 24-1449 3aviii 24-1155 Comments Received TRM Select Committee.pdf](#)

Warren Cushman was called to speak.

Upon the motion by Council Member Kinman and second by Council Member Glaser, for the Policy Advisory Council (Council) to urges the Commission to support the 'Hybrid' scenario which aligns with the higher expectations outlined in the Council's motion of August 27, 2024 to forward the following recommendations to the Commission on Council priorities for a transportation revenue measure as follows: Having a transit measure that covers the 27 transit agencies in the 9 counties; Focus on rider experience and not agency experience, including maintaining and improving service with well-coordinated fares, schedules, wayfinding, and other aspects of user experience; and Have a regional measure that is transformational and has benefits for current and future generations. Noting there many gaps that need to be addressed. With continued support efforts to encourage participation from all counties and to meet the goals of the Transformation Action Plan. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 19 - Chair Pamela Campos, Vice Chair Michael Baldini, Council Member Carline Au, Council Member Diana Benitez, Council Member Zack Deutsch-Gross, Council Member Anne Olivia Eldred, Council Member Gerry Glaser, Council Member William Goodwin, Council Member Dwayne Hankerson, Council Member Wendi Kallins, Council Member Randi Kinman, Council Member Adina Levin, Council Member Gabriela Orantes, Council Member Johnny Parker, Council Member Phillip Pierce, Council Member Jeffrey Rhoads, Council Member Terry Scott, Council Member Jaime Vioria and Council Member Howard Wong

Nay: 3 - Council Member Pradeep Gupta, Council Member Charley Lavery and Council Member Vinay Pimple

Absent: 4 - Council Member Ilaf Esuf, Council Member Chris Fitzgerald, Council Member Carina Lieu and Council Member Roland Wong

6c. [24-1247](#) Next Generation Bay Area Freeways Study: Round 2 Findings and Next Steps
(45 minutes)

Findings from the second round of analysis, including evaluation of all-lane tolling, regional mileage-based fee, and express lane pathways, as well as next steps.

Action: Information and Discussion

Presenter: Anup Tapase

Attachments: [6ci 24-1247 Summary Sheet NextGen BayArea Freeways Study.pdf](#)
[6cii 24-1247 PowerPoint Attachment A NextGen BayArea Freeways Study REV.pdf](#)
[6ciii 24-1247 Attachment B NextGen BayArea Freeways Study.pdf](#)

Warren Cushman was called to speak.

6d. [24-1475](#) MTC and ABAG Advisory Council Strategy
(15 minutes)

Overview of a concept to create an integrated advisory council to serve both the MTC Commission and ABAG Executive Board.

Action: Information and Discussion

Presenter: Matt Maloney and Ky-Nam Miller

Attachments: [6di 24-1475 Cover Summary Sheet MTC and ABAG Advisory Council Strategy.pdf](#)
[6dii 24-1475 8b 24-1153 Summary Sheet MTC and ABAG Advisory Council Strategy.pdf](#)
[6diii 24-1475 8bi 24-1153 Public Comment Received MTC and ABAG Advisory Council Strategy.pdf](#)

Warren Cushman was called to speak.

- 6e. [24-1221](#) Staff Liaison Report
(3 minutes)

Overview of recent MTC policy decisions and other activities.

Action: Information

Presenter: Kÿ-Nam Miller, Staff Liaison

Attachments: [6e_24-1221_Summary_Sheet_Nov_2024_Staff_Liaison_Report.pdf](#)

- 6f. [24-1524](#) Notice of Appreciation for Chair Pamela Campos on the occasion of her departure from the Policy Advisory Council.

Action: Approval

Presenter: Kÿ-Nam Miller, Staff Liaison

Agenda Item 6f. Notice of Appreciation for Chair Pamela Campos was deferred to the December 17, 2024 Meeting.

- 6g. [24-1220](#) Subcommittee Reports
(10 minutes)

Action: Information

Presenter: Christine Fitzgerald, Policy Advisory Council Equity & Access Subcommittee Chair

- 6h. [24-1222](#) Council Member Reports
(5 minutes)

Members of the Council may report on locally relevant issues or events.

Action: Information

Presenter: Pamela Campos, MTC Council Chair

- 6i. [24-1223](#) New Business
(5 minutes)

Members of the Council may bring up new business for discussion or addition to a future agenda.

Action: Discussion

Presenter: Pamela Campos, MTC Council Chair

Council Chair Campos appointed William Goodwin to the Policy Advisory Council Equity and Access Subcommittee as an Alternate.

7. Adjournment / Next Meeting

The next meeting of the MTC Policy Advisory Council will be held on Tuesday, December 17, 2024, at 10:00 a.m. at the Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA. Any changes to the schedule will be duly noticed to the public.